

# THE LISMORE'S LIST.

## DIVERGENT OPINIONS AT DUBLIN INQUIRY.

### VESSEL'S DESIGNER GIVES EVIDENCE.

#### IMPORTANCE OF POLICEMAN'S NOTEBOOK.

With the calling, yesterday, of Mr. David Frew, the naval architect who designed the City of Cork Steam Packet Company's steamer Lismore, the inquiry into the foundering of this almost new vessel has reached its penultimate stage. Evidence as to material times is closed, and, with two exceptions, testimony regarding the list to port has been disposed of.

All that now remains before the final summing up is to call technical evidence regarding the building and construction of the vessel. The exceptions referred to are the two shipmasters employed on the Steam Packet Company's other vessels, who saw the Lismore proceeding down the river on the day which has become so important.

The sole survivor was recalled yesterday, and with the aid of a device invented by one of the nautical assessors indicated that the Lismore, on leaving Cork, had a list to port of about 5 degrees, and by midnight, when he came from below, that list had increased to something like 20 degrees.

Mr. Overend said he had fourteen witnesses as to times of arrival and departure, eight of whom were independent, but the president intimated that it would not be necessary to call them.

An ex-R.I.C. sergeant produced a notebook kept for his own purpose, which showed times which are material to the inquiry.

### DETERMINING VESSEL'S LIST. DEVICE TO HELP WITNESSES.

(From Our Own Reporter.)

DUBLIN, Monday.

THE formal inquiry into the circumstances of the foundering, on July 10th, off the Wexford coast, of the City of Cork Steam Packet Company's steamer Lismore, was resumed at Dublin Castle to-day, before Mr. G. Cussen, assisted by four nautical assessors.

The President, at the outset of to-day's sitting, called attention to the apparent difficulty experienced by some witnesses in putting a measurement to the angle of the list of the Lismore, to which reference has been repeatedly made.

There was also the difficulty confronting the assessors and himself that while some witnesses spoke of a list of one and a half

inches, others were unable to say whether it was a degree or more or less.

To obviate this difficulty, Mr. Mares, the naval architect assessor, had prepared a device which would show to the eye what would be a list of a degree and various larger and smaller amounts. It consists of the end view of a cardboard ship attached by one drawing-pin to a drawing-board. He suggested that it should be utilised by witnesses.

#### SHIPMASTERS TO BE CALLED.

Mr. Overend, K.C., for the City of Cork Steam Packet Company, said he was calling two masters, who are in the employ of the company, and who saw the Lismore proceeding down river on her last voyage. He thought they would be able to deal with the device more accurately than other witnesses.

Mr. Swayne, K.C., who is conducting the case on behalf of the Department of Industry and Commerce, said it was his intention to-day to call important witnesses as to the list, and he proposed to ask them to indicate the angle on the device.

Mr. William Kingston, civil engineer and metallurgist at Messrs. Fords' Works, said he happened to arrive at Monkstown Station, Cork, at 6.40 on the night of July 10, and saw the Lismore coming down river. He noticed she had a list to port.

Mr. Swayne.—Speaking as an engineer, can you give us an idea in degrees? What was the extent of the list?

Witness.—To the best of my belief I should say she had about five degrees' list. I first saw her end on, and then she passed me on her way out. I had her under observation while she was travelling about quarter of a mile, during which time the list was continuous.

To Mr. Overend witness said although the masts of the vessel raked (or slanted) aft as he was looking fore and aft, there was no difficulty in judging the angle of the list.

#### LOADING THE CATTLE.

William Coleman, in charge of transport at Fords' Works, remembered the arrival of the Lismore on July 9, which he fixed at about ten past eight in the morning. He agreed with a witness who said she started unloading about twelve. His men finished work upon her at a quarter to six the following day. She started loading at eight o'clock a.m., and to the best of his belief the men worked from eight until twelve trucking cargo on to the quay to be put on board.

John Moore, a cattle drover employed by Mr. Maroney, a cattle dealer, said he was working on the morning of the 10th July in connection with the loading of cattle on to the Lismore. She had not arrived at one o'clock, but when he came back from dinner she was there shortly before two. They started loading cattle half an hour later, and it took until quarter or half-past five. Afterwards he saw the Lismore going out, and he noticed she was on her left side and had a big list, which he indicated on the model.

In reply to Mr. Overend, he said when some of the cattle went on board he saw the vessel take a slight list to starboard.

Michael Griffin, another witness employed at Cork Harbour, said the Lismore when she went out had a bit of a list, in reference to which a man spoke to him, "but," said witness, "I said she would very likely settle down."

Mr. Overend.—Is it quite usual for a vessel to go out with a list like that?—Yes.

Is it sometimes worse than she had?—Well, I don't know, but she had a cant.

Mr. Morris, superintendent engineer to the City of Cork Steam Packet Co., and other witnesses were recalled to indicate what was their idea of the amount of list which the vessel had when proceeding down the river.

#### SHEER OF THE BOAT.

John Carley was recalled for the same purpose, and preferring to show the list by means of the wooden model of the steamer rather than by the cardboard device, he intimated that

going down the river there was a considerable list amounting to at least five degrees, whereas when he came on deck after resting, which would be about midnight, it would be somewhere in the neighbourhood of 20 degrees. He noticed that the cattle doors were not far from the water's edge.

In regard to the sheer of the boat, it was about level when he was called by a man named Watterson, shortly before midnight, and got on to the floor, he noticed that there was a change in the list which tended to make him slip down on to the port side.

Questioned by Mr. Swayne, Carley said the helm was not put hard over. She answered to her helm immediately. When Watterson called him shortly before midnight he was at once fully awake and proceeded to ask what the weather was like now. He had been steering and generally seeking such information as might be useful when he took over the watch. On leaving Cork the first thing they did was to lash down the derricks.

#### "CRACKING AND BREAKING."

With reference to the conditions which obtained when he came on deck about midnight on July 10th, he said he did not notice whether any of the cattle pens had been carried away, but afterwards when she heeled over plenty of cracking and breaking could be heard among the timber. It was after the telegraph had rung that he heard those sounds. There was sufficient space at No. 3 gangway to allow cattle to be jettisoned, if necessary.

Both doors fore and aft could be opened. To the best of his knowledge the freeing ports were all clear. They were a bit stiff, but whenever the men had a chance they were oiling them and working them to make them as easy as they could.

Included in the 19 men on board, of whom three were cattlemen, there were three firemen, one donkeyman, a chief and a second engineer. The four seamen were split up into two watches.

The President.—Carley, were you alarmed when you came on deck about midnight?—Yes, because the vessel looked in a critical state.

Witness added that he was not, so to say, surprised that he was not called earlier; nor was he at first surprised that all hands had not been called. It was not possible to do a great deal in half an hour to save the ship, but the best thing would have been then to have got out one of the boats.

#### MASTER "IN A FUSS."

Asked by the President whether he could account in any way for the fact that all hands were not called on deck, he said he did not think the master had been on deck that watch. He believed a man of his experience would have called all men out. The second officer, who was a young man, was on watch, and when the master did come on deck he was in a bit of a fuss.

Evidence was given by Mr. Robert Wm. Sinnott, general manager of the City of Cork Steam Packet Co., and his assistant, Mr. John M'Intyre, to the effect that on the day in question the Lismore was at Penrose Quay between half-past ten and eleven. They went and inspected the vessel while the men were at dinner. They were interested in doing so because that was the first time she had loaded cattle in No. 2 hold.

Mr. M'Intyre said before she left he saw some axes on the after deck.

What was regarded by the court as important evidence was given by Michael Murphy, an ex-R.I.C. man, who for his own information kept a notebook of the happenings, such as entries and departures at Cork harbour. It showed that he went down to guard the cargo of the Lismore on the morning of July 9th, but had to wait for the men to start, which was at twelve o'clock. They finished at 5.45.

Mr. Swayne.—So there was overtime worked at Ford's that day?—Yes.

The President said the Bench had not any doubt as to the genuineness of the book.

Mr. Swayne intimated that he had warned to attend some fourteen witnesses as to time, eight of whom were independent.

The President said it would not be necessary to call them.

Mr. Sinnott informed Mr. Swayne that he could not say whether any independent naval architect was called in as consultant in regard to the construction of the Lismore. He thought Captain Humphreys, the marine superintendent of the company, would be able to tell them about that.

2701-010-605m



#### ARCHITECT'S EVIDENCE.

Mr. Frew, naval architect employed by the Ardrossan firm, who constructed the vessel, said he had been with them for five or six years, having become a naval architect through experience in a drawing office. He had the duty of drawing up the plans for the Lismore, and the stability conditions were drawn by him as well as the capacity plan. He did not have anything to do with the plans for the engines. The order for the construction was given on January 18, 1923.

As far as he was aware, there were no peculiarities about the proposed ship. There was to be a mean draft of 11ft. 6in. He would not say that was a less draft than a ship of that length often had. The fact of a ship having a deeper draft than another would not necessarily make it more stable. "There are," said he, "so many changing factors."

As far as he was aware, the plans were duly submitted to the company and the company's superintendent. He would not recommend a tender ship for use as a cattle carrier, but he would not call the Lismore a tender ship. The weight of cargo should be properly distributed.

Mr. Swaync.—If she was a tender ship any wrong distribution of cargo would be more likely to have an effect upon her?—If she was a tender ship, yes.

In regard to the Lismore, a booklet was issued with regard to the loading.

The Court adjourned until to-morrow (Tuesday), when witness will be asked to express an opinion as to whether, assuming the vessel was loaded according to the chart prepared by the witness, Mr. Perry, that would cause a list to port, and whether it might result in her turning over.

In reply to Mr. Swaync, the witness said he had not contemplated cargo being put on the fore-castle and poop decks.



© 2021

Lloyd's Register  
Foundation

W709-0105 (2 of 2)